

# AN ANALYSIS OF STUDENTS' ERRORS IN WRITING PROCEDURE TEXT AT SECOND YEAR STUDENTS OF SMK CENDANA PADANG PANJANG

Tiara Sriyana Putri<sup>1</sup>, Erlinda Syam<sup>2</sup>

Fakultas Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan Universitas Muhammadiyah Sumatera Barat

E-mail: [erlindasyam04@gmail.com](mailto:erlindasyam04@gmail.com)

## Abstract

This research has several purposes. The first was to find out the student errors in writing Procedure text at second year students of SMAN 2 Sungai Limau

The research was conducted at This research was conducted at SMK CENDANA Padangpanjang, in Jl. H. Agus no.1, Guguk Malintang, Sumatera Barat, which involved 12 students of the 2<sup>nd</sup> grade. This study collected data through writing test to generate qualitative information. The data was analyzed using percentages and frequencies to obtain data results.

The results showed that the students made errors in several types based on Surface Strategy Taxonomy: omission, addition, misformation, and misordering with total errors were 39 errors. omission is the most prevalent error, comprising 61.53% or 24 errors of the total errors, indicating frequent neglect of important elements. Addition errors follow at 28.20% or 11 errors, where irrelevant or unnecessary information disrupts the clarity of instructions. Misformation errors account for 7.69% or 3 errors, affecting the accuracy and comprehension of the text due to incorrect word usage. Misordering errors constitute only 2.05% or 1 error, but they can still impact the effectiveness of the procedure if steps are not correctly sequenced. Questionnaires suggested that

**Keyword :** *errors, procedure text*

## INTRODUCTION

English is one of the compulsory subjects that have to be learned in educational institution. The students learn English from elementary school until university levels. There are four skills that should be learned by the students in learning English, namely listening, reading, speaking and writing. One of the most important skill that should be studied by the student is writting. Writting is produce something in written form so that people can read, perform or use it ( Oxford Dictionary ). Writting is one of the most important things you do in college ( Gebhardt, 1989 ).

According to Kartono, ( 2009 ) “ writing skills are one an effort to pass on and pass on ideas or ideas to the next generation so that the idea is preserved and remains alive”. In the skill of writting a text, students must master vocabulary, diction, effectiveness of sentences, and language standards so that what is written students can understand well and right.

There are several texts that must be studied in writting, one of them is Procedure Text. Procedure Text is text which explains a process or stages to cmplete something activity. According to Mahsun ( 2014 ) “ Procedure text is text that provide instructions with sequential steps”. In the procedure text there is a text structure which is sequential and cannot be omitted, namely the goal part, part material, and steps.

Artono ( 2008 ) states that procedural text are text that explain something is accomplished through a series of actions or steps basically. Procedure manuals are part of daily life. Indicates that something is being done through steps or actions. Often use

procedural text, often without realizing it. Example include following recipe instruction on the television.

Lack of writing knowledge might lead to errors in writing, which seems to be common among students. Errors, on the surface level, includes some types such as omission, addition, misinformation and misordering. As stated by Dulay, Burt, and Krashen in Fauziati (2004) that the surface strategy highlights the way surface structures are altered learners may misform items or misorder them.

Observation on the students from SMK Cendana Padangpanjang written works suggested that they have errors in writing. Students at the second year of SMK Cendana Padangpanjang have problems in writting procedure text . Some errors were founded in students writting. Several causes were assumed to be the factors, but this writing focuses on the error types.

## METHODOLOGY

This research design is qualitative descriptive. Frankel & Wallen (1998) states that qualitative research is characterized by verbal description as its data. It"s means that data of the study was analyzed by describing, identifying and analyzing the text. Descriptive reseach means that the data of this study is described or explained in verbal description. This research analyzes types of error in writing procedure text.

This research was conducted at SMK CENDANA Padangpanjang, in Jl. H.Agus no.1, Guguk Malintang . The school has three levels ( X grade, XI grade, and XII grade) . The participants of this research were the second-year students Class TAV. The data of this study was taken from the students' writing of procedure texts in the second year of SMK CENDANA Padangpanjang, which was used as the source of the data. There were 12 students taking part in the research. The researcher collected the data by giving writing test to the students. The data in this study was collected from students' writing of procedure texts in the second year of senior high school and was conducted using documentation.

In qualitative research, the data gathered appeared in words rather than in numbers. Data analysis was the process of systematically searching and arranging the interview transcripts, observation transcripts, and other materials that the researcher accumulated to increase her understanding and to enable her to present her discoveries to others. The data of this research was analyzed from students' worksheets and documentation used during the research. The researcher analyzed the students' writing to identify errors in writing procedure texts.

### 1. Findings

This section addresses the problem statements formulated in the introduction section. The researcher collected the necessary students' data using writing test to describe types of errors students made in writing procedure texts.

#### a. Types of error made by the student

##### 1) Omission

Many students omit a word or grammatical element that is needed in an expression related to grammar. According to the data, the researcher found that there were 24 omission errors. The error example of omission would be described and evaluated in the following table.

**Table 1.3 The Example of Omission**

Name code	Error Identification	Error Correction	Error Description
AR	1 clove chopped onion.	1 clove <u>of</u> chopped onion.	This sentence is missing the word " <b>of</b> " which is needed to explain that "

			clove “ is a unit of measurement for onion.
AR	1 clove garlic chopped fine.	I clove <u>of</u> chopped fine.	This sentence is missing the word “ <b>of</b> ”.
AR	Add the rice and soya sauce.	Add the rice and <u>the</u> soya sauce.	The omission error occurs because the definite article " <b>the</b> " should be placed before "soya sauce," making it "add the rice and the soya sauce."
AR	Stir until well mixed and rice is hot.	Stir until well mixed and <u>the</u> rice is hot.	The omission error occurs because the sentence is missing the subject " <b>the</b> " before "rice," which makes the sentence incomplete.
FI	Make fried noodles	<u>How to</u> make	because the sentence is missing the subject " <b>how to</b> " before "make," which makes the sentence incomplete.
GA	Egg	Eggs	Because the word is missing the subject “ <b>s</b> ”because more than one.
MFN	Prepare tool and materials.	Prepare <u>the</u> tool and materials.	because the sentence is missing the subject " <b>the</b> " before "tool," which makes the sentence incomplete.
MFN	Add sugar and milk to taste.	Add <u>the</u> sugar and <u>the</u> milk to taste.	because the word is missing the subject " <b>the</b> ". which makes the sentence incomplete.
MFN	Pres the on button then blend .	Press the on button then blend	Thee second "s" in " <b>press</b> " is an important part of the correct spelling. By omitting one of the "s" letters, the word becomes misspelled.
MFN	Tomato juice ready to be enjoyed.	Tomato juice <u>is</u> ready to be enjoyed.	In this sentence, the verb " <b>is</b> ," which should come after "juice," is missing. This verb is necessary to complete the sentence and indicate that the tomato juice is ready for enjoyment.
MFN	Put the tomato into the <b>blend</b>	Put the tomato into the <b>blender</b>	The omission of " <b>blend</b> " makes the sentence unclear as the reader doesn't know what to use for the action. A complete sentence

			should include " <b>blender</b> " to specify the tool being used.
MS	1 cup milk.	1 cup <b>of</b> milk.	missing elements (like " <b>of</b> " and sometimes a verb) that are necessary for full clarity and correctness in a more detailed context.
MS	3 tablespoons sugar.	3 tablespoon <b>of</b> sugar.	The phrase also omits the preposition " <b>of</b> ." Including " <b>of</b> " clarifies that the sugar is being measured in tablespoons. The complete phrase should be " <b>3 tablespoons of sugar.</b> "
NA	2 slice.	2 <u>slices</u> .	The phrase should use the plural form " <b>slices</b> " instead of " <u>slice</u> ." The correct phrase is " <b>2 slices of the bread.</b> " Omitting the plural form makes the phrase grammatically incorrect.
SM	2 tablespoon of sugar	2 tablespoon of sugar	The correct measurement term should be " <b>tablespoons</b> " (plural) instead of " <b>tablespoon</b> " (singular). The omission of the plural form " <b>s</b> " leads to grammatical inaccuracy.
RA	2 tablespoon sugar.	2 <u>tablespoons</u> of sugar.	The phrase also omits the preposition " <b>of</b> ." Including " <b>of</b> " clarifies that the sugar is being measured in tablespoons
RI	Coffe	Coff <u>ee</u>	The word " <b>COFFE</b> " has one " <b>e</b> " missing, which can be seen as the omission of a crucial letter that changes the word's correct spelling. Therefore, the omission of the second " <b>e</b> " results in the incorrect form of the word " <b>coffee</b> ."
RI	Step.	Step <u>s</u>	The " <b>S</b> " is an essential part of the word " <b>STEP</b> ," and its absence changes the word and its meaning. This type of omission is related

			to incorrect spelling due to the missing letter.
RI	Prepare a glas <sub>2</sub> .	Prepare a glass <sub>2</sub> .	The "S" is an essential part of the word " <b>GLASS</b> ," and its absence changes the word and its meaning. This type of omission is related to incorrect spelling due to the missing letter..
RI	Put coffee.	Put <u>the</u> coffee.	because the word is missing the subject " <u>the</u> ". which makes the sentence incomplete.
RS	How to make <b>coffe</b> mix	How to make <b>coffee</b> mix	The word " <b>COFFE</b> " has one "e" missing, which can be seen as the omission of a crucial letter that changes the word's correct spelling. Therefore, the omission of the second "e
RS	Brew <b>coffe</b>	Brew <b>coffee</b>	The word " <b>COFFE</b> " has one "e" missing, which can be seen as the omission of a crucial letter that changes the word's correct spelling. Therefore, the omission of the second "e.
RY	2 cm bruised <b>ginyet</b>	2 cm bruised <b>ginger</b>	The term " <b>ginyet</b> " is a misspelling due to the omission of letters or incorrect letters. The correct spelling " <b>ginger</b> " includes letters that are missing or misplaced in " <b>ginyet</b> ."
RY	2 <b>tablespoon</b> of oil	2 <b>tablespoons</b> of oil	The correct measurement term should be " <b>tablespoons</b> " (plural) instead of " <b>tablespoon</b> " (singular). The omission of the plural form "s" leads to grammatical inaccuracy.

Omission errors in procedural texts often result from missing key words or elements, leading to unclear or incomplete instructions. One common issue was the omission of crucial measurement connectors. For example, in the phrase "**1 clove chopped onion**", the absence of "**of**" made it unclear that "**1 clove**" is a unit of measurement, which should be "**1 clove of chopped onion**." Similarly, "**1 clove garlic chopped fine**" should include "**of**" to properly convey the measurement, resulting in "**1 clove of garlic, chopped fine**." These omissions create ambiguity in ingredient quantities and could confuse the readers.

Another frequent issue was the omission of definite articles, which are essential for specifying particular items. For instance, "**Add the rice and soya sauce**". should be "**Add the rice and the soya sauce.**" The missing article "**the**" before "**soya sauce**" reduced clarity by not specifying which sauce was being used. Additionally, "**Stir until well mixed and rice is hot**" lacks "**the**" before "**rice,**" made the instruction less precise. Including definite articles ensured that instructions were clear and specific.

Measurement and pluralization errors also reflect omission issues. The phrase "**3 tablespoons sugar**" needs "**of**" to be correct, thus "**3 tablespoons of sugar**" provides complete measurement information. Similarly, "**2 slice**" should be "**2 slices**" to use the correct plural form. Omitting pluralization or measurement terms could lead to grammatical errors and misinterpretations of the quantities required.

Spelling errors, where letters were omitted, further impact comprehension. For example, "**Coffe**" should be "**Coffee,**" with the missing "**e**" affecting the word's spelling and meaning. Similarly, "**Prepare a glas**" should be "**Prepare a glass,**" correcting the missing "**s**" to ensure accurate spelling. Proper spelling was crucial for ensuring that instructions are clearly understood.

Finally, missing articles and incomplete sentences could compromise clarity. "**Put coffee**" needed "**the**" to become "**Put the coffee,**" making it clear which coffee was being referred to. "**Tomato juice ready to be enjoyed**" requires the verb "**is**" to be "**Tomato juice is ready to be enjoyed.**" These omissions disrupt sentence structure and clarity, making the instructions less effective.

Overall, omission errors in procedural texts, whether related to measurement connectors, articles, pluralization, spelling, or sentence structure, could significantly impair the clarity and accuracy of instructions. Addressing these omissions helped to ensure that procedural texts were precise and comprehensible.

## 2) Misformation

In this case, many students used grammatical form which was not correct. According to the data the researcher found, there were 3 Misformation errors. The errors example of Misformation would be described and evaluated in the following table:

**Table 1.4 The Example of Misformation**

Name code	Error Identification	Error Correction	Error Description
AR	Crush the red <b>repper</b> , garlic, and onion until very fine.	Crush the red <b>pepper</b> , garlic, and onion until very fine.	<b>Misformation</b> involves incorrect word structure or spelling. Since " <b>repper</b> " is a misspelled version of " <b>pepper</b> ," it fits the definition of misformation as it fails to conform to the standard spelling of the word.
AR	<b>Stil</b> until well mixed and rice is hot.	<b>Stir</b> until well mixed and rice is hot.	" <b>Stil</b> " is a misspelling of " <b>stir</b> ." This is a case of <b>misformation</b> because the word

			" <b>stil</b> " is incorrectly formed and does not represent the intended action accurately.
GA	A pinch of <b>slat</b> .	A pinch of <b>salt</b> .	The incorrect formation of the word " <b>salt</b> " as " <b>slatt</b> " disrupts the clarity and accuracy of the instruction. The correct spelling is crucial for understanding the ingredient needed.

Misinformation errors occurred when incorrect word structures or spellings impact the clarity of instructions. One example was the phrase "**Crush the red repper, garlic, and onion until very fine.**" The term "**repper**" was a misspelling of "**pepper**," which was an error in word formation. The incorrect spelling "**repper**" failed to conform to the standard spelling of "**pepper**," leading to confusion about the ingredient needed. Accurate spelling was essential for effective communication, especially in procedural texts where precise instructions are crucial.

Another instance of misinformation was seen in "**Stil until well mixed and rice is hot.**" Here, "**Stil**" was a misspelling of "**stir**." The incorrect formation of "**stil**" did not represent the intended action accurately, which could lead to misunderstanding the procedure. The correct term, "**stir**," was critical for conveying the correct action required in the process. Misinformation in this context impacts the clarity of the instruction and can cause errors in the execution of the procedure.

Additionally, "**A pinch of slat**" was another example where misinformation affects clarity. The word "**slat**" was a misspelling of "**salt**." This incorrect formation disrupts the accuracy of the instruction, as the correct spelling of "**salt**" is necessary for understanding the ingredient required. Spelling errors such as "**slat**" hinder the reader's ability to follow the recipe correctly, highlighting the importance of correct word formation in procedural texts.

Misinformation errors, including incorrect spelling and word structure, could significantly affect the clarity and accuracy of procedural texts. Ensuring that words are correctly formed and spelled is essential for effective communication and successful execution of instructions.

### 3) Addition

The addition was a part of errors that should not be required to be used in making a sentence. According to the data the researcher found, there were 11 Addition errors. The errors example of Addition would be described and evaluated in the following table:

**Table 1.5 The Example of Addition**

Name code	Error Identification	Error Correction	Error Description
FI	Bow <u>le</u> .	Bowl.	The word " <b>bowle</b> " indicates an error it should be " <b>bowl</b> ".
FI	Wait until <u>itss</u> .	Wait until <u>its</u> .	The word " <b>itss</b> " indicates an error it should be " <b>itss</b> ".

GA	Inggredients.	Ingredients.	The word” <b>inggreredients</b> ” that had been written by the student it had an error on the writing, it should be <b>“ingredients”</b> .
MS	Ingredieents.	Ingredients.	The word” <b>ingreedients</b> ” that had been written by the student it had an error on the writing, it should be <b>“ingredients”</b> .
MS	1 Eggs	1 Egg	The word” <b>1 Eggs</b> ” that had been written by the student it had an error on the writing, it should be <b>“1 egg”</b> .
NA	2 slices <b>of and</b> the bread	2 slices of the bread	The words " <b>of and the</b> " do not fit logically into the phrase and are not needed.
NA	1 <b>eggs</b>	1 <b>egg</b>	The word” <b>1 Eggs</b> ” that had been written by the student it had an error on the writing, it should be <b>“1 egg”</b> .
NA	1 tablespoon <b>of and</b> the butter	1 tablespoon of the butter	The words " <b>of and the</b> " do not fit logically into the phrase and are not needed.
NA	1 Slice <b>of and</b> the chees	1 slice of the chees	The words " <b>of and the</b> " do not fit logically into the phrase and are not needed.
RA	1 sachets of milk.	1 sachet of milk.	The word <b>“sachets”</b> indicates an error it should be <b>“sachet”</b> .
ZA	1 tablespoons of sugar	1 tablespoon of sugar	The word” <b>1 tablespoons</b> ” that had been written by the student it had an error on the writing, it should be <b>“1 tablespoon”</b> .



Addition errors occurred when extra, unnecessary elements were included in a text, which could disrupt clarity and accuracy. One example was the term "**Bowle**," where the correct term should be "**Bowl**." The inclusion of the extra letter "**e**" in "**Bowle**" added an unnecessary element that distorts the intended meaning. Accurate spelling was crucial in procedural texts to ensure that the reader clearly understands the item being referred to.

Another example was "**Wait until itss**," where the extra "**s**" is mistakenly added to "**its**." This addition created a spelling error that can confuse the reader, as "**itss**" is not a valid word. The correct term should be "**its**," and removing the extra letter would restore clarity. Addition errors like this can lead to misunderstanding or misinterpretation of the instructions.

The term "**Ingredients**" illustrated an addition error where an extra "**g**" is included in "**Ingredients**." The correct spelling does not require the additional "**g**," and its presence made the word incorrect. Such errors can affect the reader's ability to accurately identify and use the ingredients listed in the text.

Similarly, "**Ingredieents**" showed an error where an extra "**e**" is added to "**Ingredients**." This addition distorted the correct spelling and can lead to confusion about the ingredients required. Ensuring that no unnecessary elements are added helps maintain the precision of procedural instructions.

Addition errors involved the inclusion of extra, unnecessary elements that disrupt the clarity and accuracy of procedural texts. Correct spelling and avoidance of unnecessary additions are essential for effective communication and the successful execution of instructions.

#### 4) Misordering

This category is relatively uncontroversial. The learners can select the right forms to use in the right context, but they arrange them in the wrong order. According to the data the researcher found, there were 1 misordering error. The errors example of Misordering would be described and evaluated in the following table:

**Table 1.6 The Example of Misordering**

Name code	Error Identification	Error Correction	Error Description
RS	Enough add.	Add enough.	because the words are in the wrong order, making the sentence incorrect and unclear. The correct order should be "add enough."

Misordering errors occur when the sequence of words or phrases is incorrect, which affects the clarity and correctness of instructions. One example of misordering was the phrase "**Enough add**." The incorrect word order made the instruction unclear and misleading. The correct sequence should be "**Add enough**." This adjustment places the verb "**add**" before the qualifier "**enough**," which correctly conveyed the intended action of adding a sufficient amount of the ingredient.

In procedural texts, proper word order is essential for accurately communicating instructions. "**Enough add**" failed to provide a clear directive because it disrupts the logical flow of the sentence. The reader might struggle to understand what action was required, leading to potential errors in following the procedure. By reordering the words to "**Add enough**," the instruction becomes straightforward and easy to follow, ensuring that the reader knows to add a sufficient quantity of the specified item.

Overall, misordering errors, such as the incorrect sequence in "**Enough add**,"

highlighted the importance of maintaining proper word order to ensure clear and effective communication in procedural texts. Correctly arranging words helps prevent confusion and ensures that instructions are easily understood and accurately executed.

The table below provided an overview of the percentage of common errors made by students in writing procedure texts. The table analyzes four main categories of errors: omission, misformation, addition, and misordering. Each category highlighted specific areas where students are prone to make error, which can affect the clarity and effectiveness of the procedure texts they write.

From the table, it can be observed the distribution of percentages for each type of error, offering insights into how frequently each error occurs. This data was crucial for identifying common error patterns, which can then be used to develop more effective teaching strategies aimed at improving students' writing skills in procedure texts.

**Table 1.7 The Total Frequency of the Type of Errors**

No	Types of errors	Frequency	Percentage (%)
1	Omission	24	61,53 %
2	Misformation	3	7,69 %
3	Addition	11	28,20 %
4	Misordering	1	2,05 %
Total		49	100 %

In the analysis of errors in procedural text writing, the most frequent error was omission, accounting for 61.53% of the total mistakes. This indicated that students often leave out important elements in their texts, leading to incomplete and unclear instructions. Addressing this issue is crucial to improving the quality of the procedural texts produced by students.

Following omission, addition errors represented 28.20% of the total errors. These errors occurred when students include irrelevant information or unnecessary elements in their procedural texts. Such additions can disrupt the flow of instructions and cause confusion for the reader. Therefore, it was important to ensure that each element in a procedural text serves a clear and relevant purpose.

Misformation errors contributed 7.69% to the overall error count. Although this percentage was smaller compared to omission and addition errors, misformation could still impact the clarity and accuracy of instructions. These errors often involved the use of incorrect words or phrases, which can lead to misinterpretation of the procedural text.

Finally, misordering errors made up only 2.05% of the total mistakes. Despite its small proportion, misordering was significant because it can affect the understanding and execution of procedures if steps are not arranged in the correct order. Overall, attention should be given to all types of errors to enhance the effectiveness of procedural texts.

Here, the writer interpreted the errors based on their types:

Percentage of students,, errors based on the frequency of the types of errors

(  $P = \frac{F}{N} \times 100\%$  ) :

*N*

1) Omission :  $\frac{24}{39} \times 100\% = 61,53\%$

2) Misformation :  $\frac{3}{39} \times 100\% = 7,69\%$

3) Addition :  $\frac{11}{39} \times 100\% = 28,20\%$

$$4) \text{ Misordering} : \frac{1}{39} \times 100\% = 2,05\%$$

## 2. Conclusion

In conclusion, for the first formulation of the problem, the writer found that the students made errors in types of errors based on Surface Strategy Taxonomy: omission, addition, misinformation, and misordering with total errors were 39 errors. omission is the most prevalent error, comprising 61.53% or 24 errors of the total errors, indicating frequent neglect of important elements. Addition errors follow at 28.20% or 11 errors, where irrelevant or unnecessary information disrupts the clarity of instructions. Misinformation errors account for 7.69% or 3 errors, affecting the accuracy and comprehension of the text due to incorrect word usage. Lastly, misordering errors constitute only 2.05% or 1 error, but they can still impact the effectiveness of the procedure if steps are not correctly sequenced. Addressing these errors is essential to improve the overall quality and clarity of procedural texts.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Artono et all. (2008). For Grade VII Junior High School ( Mts / Ed 1 jakarta : Pusat Perbukuan : Departement Pendidikan Nasional (book).
- Fauzati, E. (2004). *Interlanguage and Error Fossilization: A Study on Second Language Acquisition in Indonesia*. Muhammadiyah University Press.
- Gebhard, M., Shin, D. S., & Seger, W. (2011). Blogging and Emergent L2 Literacy Development in an Urban Elementary School. *Calico Journal*, 28(2), 278-307.
- Kartono, J. (2018). *STUDENTS' GRAMMATICAL ERROR IN TRANSLATION FROM INDONESIAN INTO ENGLISH IN 2017/2018 ACCADEMIC YEAR* (Doctoral dissertation, UIN Raden Intan Lampung).
- Mahfuzoh, M. (2022). The Use of Effective Sentences on Procedure Text for Class VII Students of Terpadu Islamic Junior High School, Batujaya. *EDUCTUM: Journal Research*, 1(1), 7-11.
- Wallen, N. E., & Fraenkel, J. R. (2013). *Educational research: A guide to the process*. Routledge.